



6000 Doug Attaway Blvd. | Shreveport, LA 71115 | P (318)524-2272 | F (318)524-2273 | port@portsb.com | www.portcb.com

Regular Board Meeting
Regional Commerce Center, Board Room
6000 Doug Attaway Blvd., Shreveport, LA 71115
December 17, 2015

The regular monthly Board meeting of the Caddo-Bossier Parishes Port Commission was called to order by President Capt. Thomas F. Murphy at approximately 4:30 p.m. in the Board Room of the Regional Commerce Center, 6000 Doug Attaway Blvd., Shreveport, LA and everyone welcomed.

Commissioner Prescott led the Pledge of Allegiance.

Commissioner Murphy called on Mr. England for roll call: Capt. Thomas F. Murphy, Erica R. Bryant, Sam N. Gregorio, James D. Hall, James L. Pannell, Rick C. Prescott and Steve Watkins. A quorum was present. Absent: Lynn Austin and Roy Griggs. Guests: Mike Middleton, Caddo Parish Commissioner - Elect; Mr. Byrd; Daniel Strickland, Gremillion & Pou; George Carroll and Joe Johnson, Residents. Staff: Eric England, Kathy French, Danyne Malone, Brenda Levinson, Rick Nance, Ted Knight, Gloria Washington, Mary Ward and Hettie Agee.

Commissioner Murphy asked if anyone would like to make a public comment at this time. Commissioner Murphy recognized Mr. Joe Johnson who came to the podium and said my name is Joe Johnson, and last month I spoke to all of you about some concerns we had as private property owners in the face of Port expansion and I asked a very specific question and apparently I wasn't specific enough regarding concerns we have about encroachment upon property rights and the effect on our property with Heavy Industrial Zoning if that happens. After I asked that question, Capt. Murphy instructed Eric to respond to that question and I appreciate that. Eric responded with a letter and a diagram, Table 33 from the Burk-Kleinpeter's study, which I also appreciated. Unfortunately, it's not exactly what I was looking for. Table 33 from the Burk-Kleinpeter's study is set up as a spread sheet type format listing all of your candidate properties with a weighted average, the pro's and the con's, along with a note section out to the right with potential solutions. Now I already have this copy in my data base and ironically it was this document and the omissions from this document that spurred me to ask the question to begin with. So what I would like to do is talk about this document first, specifically as to why I had the concerns. For expediency, for I know we have a long meeting today, all of the pros were the same. These are all green field sites. There's 18 of them listed and it lists the numerical rank, beginning with the most desirable, No. 1 and all the way down to the least desirable of No. 18. But these are all still viable candidates. They've also listed the cons and then out to the side

"This institution is an equal opportunity provider and employer."

MEMBERS: Capt. Thomas F. Murphy, President; Sam N. Gregorio, Vice President; Rick C. Prescott, Secretary-Treasurer; Lynn Austin; Erica R. Bryant; Roy Griggs; James D. Hall; James L. Pannell; Steve Watkins

they've listed the note sections which are potential proposed solutions. I'm gonna start with Candidate No. 1 which is at the highest on the list.

Ranked No. 1, Candidate Site B, and as I said, all of the pros are the same, "green field sites ready for development". The con on this particular property was "possible cemetery, further investigation required; residential homes on site according to satellite imagery". Now the notes respond by saying, "prior to purchasing, it is recommended the Port properly identify the location of the cemetery". There's no mention of what to do with the residential homes on the site. The next one on your list is ranked No. 3, Candidate Site E. Residential homes on site according to satellite imagery; agricultural lease agreement. The proposed solution was prior to purchasing, it is recommended the Port conduct investigation on the lease terms, the agricultural lease. Again, no mention of what to do with the residential home owners there. The next one down is No. 4 on the list, Candidate Site F. The con is "residential homes on site according to satellite imagery". Out to the note section, it's just blank. There's no solution or opinion offered whatsoever. Next one down is No. 5, Candidate Site H, "residential homes on site according to satellite imagery; one small agricultural facility according to satellite imagery; portion of this site is LSU Agricultural Farm...". The note section on this one is a little more detailed. "Part of the site is LSU Agricultural Farm in Bossier Parish, purchase of this land could be affected by state ownership of parcels, it is recommended that the Port conduct investigation for the feasibility of purchase from Ag Center". Again no mention of the residential home site. Next one down the list with a residential home as a con is No. 9. It's Candidate G. "Residential homes on site according to satellite imagery; one small business site according to satellite imagery". Again on this one, it's blank. There's nothing as far as the solution. Next one down is No. 12, Candidate Q. "Weight limit of 25-40 tons just south of site". (I'm assuming that's a bridge). "Residential homes on site according to satellite imagery; 50+ oil and gas wells, active and inactive; possible cemetery, further investigation required". The note on this one is "Mary Magdalene cemetery, exact location should be identified prior to purchasing". Again no mention of what to do with the residential home site. No. 14 is Candidate R. Same thing, residential home on site. The difference of course this one is a partnership with Caspiana Land Co. The solution: "partnership with Caspiana Land Co; prior to purchasing, it is recommended the Port conduct investigation on partnership terms". No mention of what to do with the residential home sites, the only concerns they have. No. 15, Candidate I, "residential home on site according to satellite imagery; Bossier Reservoir is part of this site". Blank on the solution. Nothing, no mention. Next one down is 16, Candidate D. "Weight limit of 25-40 tons near site; residential homes on site; partnership with Caspiana Land". Solution: "prior to purchasing, it is recommended the Port conduct an investigation on the partnership terms". I am again assuming the agricultural lease

or with Caspiana Land Company. Again, no mention of the residential home site. Next one down is No. 17, Candidate K. "10+ residential homes and lots according to satellite imagery. Weight limit of 5 tons near the site". Again, probably talking about a bridge. Solution on this is nothing. No limit.

This particular document is why I was curious. You know it's why I have the concern that there's no mention of residential home sites other than acknowledging their existence. So what I wanted to talk to you about was I'm gonna rephrase that question because I may not have been specific enough. Eric did respond and I appreciate it. But before I get to that, I would like to get to the letter that Eric sent. Again, I appreciate the time you took. In that letter you said and I'm quoting you directly, "Attached please find pgs. 153 and 154 from the Commission's Port Expansion Study which was adopted by the Commission on October 15, 2015. As you will see residential homes were indeed considered and discussed during the development of this study." Now I do recognize that Table 33 did acknowledge their existence. But as there's no solutions out here with what to do with them is why I would like all information from the public request that we're going to give to you about those discussions and about what was determined as far as any considerations or merits of those considerations. As far as the question, and I'm going to be specific, because I may not have been clear last time and I apologize for that. When the Port purchases property that borders pre-established existing home sites, there is inevitably going to be potential opposition from people living there. They have been living there for decades. There's going to be opposition to zoning, opposition to noise, lights, the whole range of concerns, as well as potential litigation. So my question is this specifically. When that happens, and I'm pretty sure it will because I have already talked to some of the people in some of these locations. I haven't tracked down all of their addresses yet. But a common consensus is coming up that people do not want a Heavy Industrial Zone right beside their houses. So when this opposition takes place, when the zoning is delayed, when there's threats of litigation, specifically what is the Port's plan of action for dealing with those concerns? And that's what I was referring about concerns and being mentioned in the study. I didn't mean just acknowledging that they lived there, because you can see the pictures with the satellites. I meant what is to be done? And I want to be clear. This is not an attempt to embarrass anyone here, a gotcha question, or anything like that because I've talked with all of you. I've dealt with Eric numerous times and I appreciate the responses. But it is a valid concern. You know people's homes are their biggest single investment for most people and they're going to be frightened when they see an impending commercial development. I'm not talking about a warehouse or an office building, but a 24/7 Heavy Industrial Zone. People aren't gonna like that. It's gonna cause some concerns of possibility for disasters, chemical spills, explosions that happens all the time. Just google it. It's everywhere. So that is my question and I would like response

like I did last time. And I do appreciate you responding to it. Once again, I thank the Commission for their time. Merry Christmas. Thank you Eric and thank you Port staff.

Captain Murphy thanked Mr. Johnson and said we would move on to Public Hearing.

Public Hearing: 2015 Amended General Fund and Capital Operations Budgets of the Caddo-Bossier Parishes Port Commission: Commissioner Murphy said we will now open the Public Hearing pursuant to RS 39:1307 of the Louisiana Local Government Budget Act. Do I hear any public comments regarding the 2015 Amended General Fund and Capital Operations Budgets of the Caddo-Bossier Parishes Port Commission? Hearing no comments, we will continue with the meeting. These budgets will be considered and discussed under New Business later in our meeting.

Public Hearing: 2016 General Fund and Capital Operations Budgets of the Caddo-Bossier Parishes Port Commission: Commissioner Murphy said we will now open the Public Hearing pursuant to RS 39:1307 of the Louisiana Local Government Budget Act. Do I hear any public comments regarding the 2016 General Fund and Capital Operations Budgets of the Caddo-Bossier Parishes Port Commission? Hearing no comments, we will continue with the meeting. These budgets will be considered and discussed under New Business later in our meeting.

Approval of the Regular Meeting Minutes of November 19, 2015: Commissioner Prescott said the Regular Board Meeting minutes of November 19, 2015 are in your packets. If there are no deletions, additions or corrections, I make a motion that the approval of the Regular Meeting minutes of November 19, 2015 be accepted. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Hall. Commissioner Murphy said it had been moved and seconded we approve the Regular minutes of November 19, 2015. Any discussion? Hearing no discussion, the vote was called for. All in favor, please say "Aye". Opposed, "Nay". The motion passes unanimously.

Approval of the November 2015 Financials: Commissioner Prescott said the November 2015 Financial Reports are also in your packets. If there are no corrections, additions or deletions, I make a motion that the approval of the November 2015 Financial Reports be accepted. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Pannell. Commissioner Murphy said it had been moved and seconded for approval of the 2015 Financials for November. Any discussion? Hearing no discussion, the vote was called for. All in favor, please say "Aye". Opposed, "Nay". The motion passes unanimously.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS:

Marketing Committee Report of December 7, 2015: Commission President Thomas F. Murphy called the Marketing Committee meeting of December 7, 2015 to order at approximately 12:00 Noon in the Board Room at the Regional Commerce Center and asked that everyone rise for a moment of silence in remembrance of the date, a date which will live in infamy, December 7th.

Commissioner Gregorio led the Pledge of Allegiance.

Commissioners present: Erica R. Bryant, Sam N. Gregorio, Roy Griggs, James D. Hall, Capt. Thomas F. Murphy, James L. Pannell, Rick C. Prescott and Steve Watkins. A quorum was present.

Commissioner Prescott called for introduction of guests. Guests in attendance: Anne Gremillion and Daniel Strickland, Gremillion & Pou; Liz McCain, City of Shreveport; David Herskovits and Eli Oppenheimer, Energiya USA; Kevin Bryan-KBA and Alison Samuels. Staff members: Eric England, Rick Nance, Brenda Levinson, Dannye Malone, Gloria Washington, Ted Knight, Kathy French, Hugh McConnell, Mary Ward and Hettie Agee.

Commissioner Prescott called for Public Comments. Hearing none, he called on Brenda for a Customer Update. Her report included: ADS Logistics; Calumet; Pratt; Ronpak and Ternium. On new business – Benteler reported the Quench & Temper Expansion is now dried in; they have received a temporary occupancy permit from the State Fire Marshall and the move should be completed by December 4th. On the operations side, equipment is now functional on Finishing Lines 1 and 2; Performance Tests were successfully completed on Finishing Line 2; production is now running on both finishing lines. Their ramp-up focus has been on continued debugging and process stabilization. On new prospects, we had an International client pay a visit to the Port on November 30th. This company is well known worldwide and has 50,000 employees, 700 subsidiaries, 200 affiliated companies. We're moving forward on talks with them after having our first contact back in August of this year through LED. We'll keep you informed. Calling for questions, Commissioner Gregorio said the gray water option, they liked that? Brenda said absolutely. Gray water, up until this project if we're able to work with this, is that Pratt is our biggest user of 1 g/p/d. So the gray water, even though there's some limitations, so the gray water would be a way to work with them. Commissioner Pannell said I'm trying to remember—wasn't there an issue that we needed to do with the gray water system? Is this good the way it is? Brenda said the reason that there's some issues is with the suspended particles in the gray water. So depending on your process, how well your system can tolerate the particles or how much chemical would have to be added to it—since this process is going to be chemically related, I'm quite confident they could clean it up just as clean as they need it to be. Commissioner Pannell said so there's nothing we need to do additionally. Brenda said I think at this point what we actually talked to them about was with the water coming into the site was them to get the water to a PH and everything that they needed. Commissioner Pannell said and they handle it once it gets to the site. Thank you.

Commissioner Prescott called on Kathy for a public affairs report. Kathy said once again I wanted to thank you all for the opportunity to work for the Caddo-Bossier Parishes Port Commission. In your package you are going to find the publicity and print media for November along with the calendar and the websites stats for November. Again our website stats are showing progress over last year as well as last month. A special note of "Congratulations" for our own Gremillion & Pou's Daniel Strickland for being selected as one of the prestigious 40 Under 40 recipients, an honor which celebrates the achievements of our younger leaders. In your packets please note the article about our partnership with the Port of New Orleans in conjunction with the shipping of the Priefert steel coils. You have a handout which is the *Biz Magazine* article for December titled "*The Silent Engine*". It really captures the essence of the Commission's work here at our Port. You can also view it on our Face Book page as well as our website.

Thank you to the Commission for being supporters for the Mayors Prayer Breakfast. Speaking on behalf of the Port, in November we presented at the InterTech Committee as well as the South Shreveport Rotary Club. I was given the opportunity to thank the Caddo Parish Commission and the Bossier Parish Police Jury while delivering the 2016 Budgets. Also the sandbagging machines should be arriving in January for the partnership between the Police Jury and Bossier City etc. We hosted a meeting here in the RCC for 50 people with the Governor's Office of Homeland Security & Emergency Preparedness. In the theme of continuing to thank our veterans, we were involved in Bossier Chamber's Military Relations Committee's Toys for Tots, and the end of the year meetings for both the Military Affairs Council and the 2nd Bomb wing. Last week there was a special tribute for our late Pearl Harbor veterans, Bob Matheny, at the Bossier Rotary Club. In January, the Commission's going to be a corporate sponsor for the Bossier Chamber's Annual Gala on Thursday, January 28th at 7 p.m. We have a table for 8 and will be held at the Century Link Center. Tuesday, February 23rd, we will be hosting at the RCC the Breakfast of Champions for the Greater Shreveport Chamber of Commerce. Both of those events are on the Commissioner's calendar. We are continuing our work with StarBase on bringing 170 kids to the RCC in April. Next year, we have many other speaking engagements and other opportunities for our Commissioners to represent our Port at various functions. Any questions?

Commissioner Pannell said Jimmy and I, along with Capt. Murphy and Eric, most people see Daniel and know he's here and know he does something. But once you become President or these other positions, that's the man who's going to take care of you. That's who makes us look good. Daniel please stand up if you would. Thank you.

Commissioner Prescott called on Eric for the monthly reports. Eric said we scheduled a couple of committee meetings. I wanted to give you some information on those. On the 14th, we'll have an Intergovernmental Committee meeting. Markey will be with us giving us an update on the elections and what we can expect in early 2016 legislatively at the State level. Again, on the 14th at noon, lunch will be served. The Personnel Committee will be on the same date as our Board meeting. It will precede the Board meeting at 3:00 p.m. That committee is chaired by Commissioner Bryant. Of course, the Board meeting is at 4:30 p.m. This is the time of year when we will have the Public Hearings. We'll have two Public Hearings, one for the 2015 Budgets, one for the 2016 Budgets. Of course, we'll have the Budget Ordinances for 2016. Also we'll have the Nominating Committee appointed by Commissioner Capt. Tom Murphy.

Eric said before we adjourn, we have a presentation to make. David came to the podium and said I am the CEO of a US Company involved in solar energy and thanked the committee for allowing him to be here today. A power point presentation was given with the committee being furnished handouts. At the conclusion, questions were called for. Commissioner Gregorio said when you say multiple projects in Louisiana, what's considered a project? David said a project is considered a solar farm. Commissioner Watkins said on the second page of your presentation it says "a lease payment of approximately \$20,000 annually paid to the City of New Orleans". That's probably a typo there. David said that would have to be a typo. Commissioner Gregorio asked how many employees would be created. What I mean by that is in the Shreveport-Bossier area. David said I think that we're working through all the details. Basically it would be up to 25 employees permanently that would be operating and maintaining the system and overseeing it but over 450 construction jobs, in terms of that, probably a 12 month construction period. Commissioner Pannell said are you going to have any kind of reflection issue? David said that is something we can look at. We've gotten very familiar with that. Our engineers have gotten very comfortable with that. Commissioner Pannell said but there's no glare as far as.....David said there can be glare and can be an issue but ultimately we can design around it and make sure there's not. Commissioner Pannell said that would be a base of the location hypothetically at the Port, whatever site,

would be based on some of those factors. Commissioner Gregorio said Barksdale here is a pretty major employer. Do you run all this by Barksdale. You know their landing is right over there. Do you have plans to run that by the Barksdale people? David said again it will be up to you as to the location. Commissioner Gregorio said that will probably be on the list. Commissioner Watkins asked how many acres do you—I know you're on the front end of your deal--do you have some kind of range? David said they have always talked to us about 200 to 500 acres. Again, we're very much on the front end and there's variance on the front end.

Hearing no further business to bring before the Marketing Committee, Commissioner Prescott adjourned the meeting at approximately 12:33 p.m.

Commissioner Prescott said the minutes from the Marketing Committee of December 7, 2015 are in your packets. If there are no corrections or deletions, I make a motion that they be accepted. Any discussion? Hearing no discussion, the vote was called for. All in favor, please say "Aye". Opposed, "Nay". The motion passed unanimously.

Operations Committee Report of December 7, 2015: The meeting was called to order by Vice President Sam N. Gregorio at approximately 12:39 p.m., December 7, 2015, at the Regional Commerce Center Board Room. I noticed no new people have come in. Is there any public comments?

Commissioners present: Erica R. Bryant, Sam N. Gregorio, Roy Griggs, James D. Hall, Capt. Thomas F. Murphy, James L. Pannell, Rick C. Prescott and Steve Watkins. A quorum was present.

Guests in attendance: Anne Gremillion and Daniel Strickland, Gremillion & Pou; Liz McCain, City of Shreveport; David Herskovits and Eli Oppenheimer, Energiya USA; Kevin Bryan-KBA and Alison Samuels. Staff members: Eric England, Rick Nance, Brenda Levinson, Danyne Malone, Gloria Washington, Ted Knight, Kathy French, Hugh McConnell, Mary Ward and Hettie Agee.

Commissioner Gregorio called for Public Comments. Hearing none, Commissioner Gregorio called on Hugh for the Operations report. Hugh said rail activity for November was pretty steady. The steel products are still our biggest movers coming into the Port and that's steel coils and billets and ingots for Ternium. Benteler and ADS Logistics, those three combined recorded 185 cars coming into the Port, nearly 16,000 tons. For an average over the year, it's been about 14,000 tons a month. The steel products accounts for 63% of the rail cargo coming into our Port. The other items are agricultural, aggregate and frac media. The next largest commodity reported was the frac media and that was Oakley, Carbo and Hexion. All three combined recorded a little over 3,000 tons of frac media into the Port. The next, of course, was petroleum, for over 1800 tons and that's Genesis, Omni, and Calumet. So you can kind of see the difference of volume. The tonnage from the steel was nearly 60,000 and the other commodities are 3000 to 1800. So steel is by far the largest mover. Oakley recorded 993 tons of agricultural product which is seasonal in spring and fall. I wanted to let you know we've got some tie replacement going on the tracks. Even though volumes are down a bit, the ties still wear in weather, so we still have maintenance to do on the track. We're starting the tie program now and through the spring of 2016 replacing the timber ties we have out there. Another project that's going on, Hexion is installing some card readers or scanners. Their dispatch team is in Houston and so they may or may not have visuals of the cars all the time; they're not in people's sight all the time, so this will give them clarity on where the cars are in the UP system, but also when they arrive at the Port, let them know that a car has arrived. They're willing to share that data with us for a fee. There's a subscription fee. We don't know

yet if that's going to be useful information for us yet because we go on site and manually record those car numbers. We're not sure yet if that's something we want to do. We've thought about it for several years. We're going to look at their project as kind of an experiment and see if we want to tack on to that later. In total, there were 295 cars that came to the Port, a little over 25,000 tons of rail cargo.

Moving on to barge activity, I know that the River was on everybody's mind this last few days. I have printed out the gage readings in Shreveport and this gives you a visual of what the high water was back in June and then what we crested at the last Friday and Saturday. The high water in June the Shreveport gage was a little over 37 ft. and then Friday, 29 ft.. That will kind of give you an idea of what it looked like there. Kathy asked me a question just while ago which is something you probably asked too or may get asked and that is how is the high water taking navigation? Right now the water is high, and so other than flow and volume of water, it makes it difficult for them to push against, so they have to get additional power. But as far as siltation and dredging needs etc., we won't know until the water gets back down to pool stage or above pool stage to know where the siltation is, where the sand bars have moved etc. Right now everything's good. As it gets down lower at pool, which is at ground 15' at the Shreveport gage, then we'll know more what the channel is like. We do have a Priefert coil barge that is on the water and should be here maybe next week. We'll be handling some more steel coils for Priefert and we found out this morning that there's a ship that's loaded. There'll be a second barge to arrive sometime in January, so we're excited about that. It's a customer that we cultivated that enjoys the Port, works well with the Port and so we're still seeing these cargos pass through here. Oakley reported 7 barges of frac media and Genesis Energy reported 4 barges of petroleum. So in total there were 11 barges, 21, 484 tons. I also wanted to mention that we hosted a meeting with Benteler and Celtic Marine. Celtic is a friend that we've done business with before and again, that's Benteler doing their due diligence talking to other freight forwarders and other companies to see what it would take to barge in billets and possibly pipe outbound. Finally we have gotten word there will be another cold box moved for Eastman Chemical next year in the spring of 2016. A company was on site riding around doing their due diligence looking. It was a heavy hauler that we have done business with before. Commissioner Murphy asked Hugh if had heard anything of restrictions lifted on day-light transit only. Hugh said I have not. I don't know that status.

Commissioner Gregorio called on Rick for Port Projects. Rick said our RCC parking lot is now closed out. The lien clearance period is up. Checked with the minorities and everybody has been paid so they'll be getting their retainage back shortly. The Ternium turnout is a small project. One of the projects we're going to do is a 12' lane to see if we're going to expand out road to two 12' lanes and then put a small apron toward them. I have some proposals out and we'll know by the next meeting how that's going. The in-motion scale has now been completed. We have not given the official lien clearance but we did the scale testing, the certified, last week. We'll close it out shortly. The main lift station for us that the City of Shreveport is doing, the estimated date of completion is the end of the year. We're starting to lose some of our European staff for the Benteler project. A few of the staff will start to depart for Christmas holiday and won't be coming back. Hugh mentioned the rail scanner for Hexion, we have some paper work for them to make sure it doesn't impact our facility or their lease agreement for us to get that installed for them.

Calling for questions and hearing none, Commissioner Gregorio called on Eric for the monthly reports.

Eric said these reports are in your packages. I'll be glad to answer any questions with regard to any of the details.

Commissioner Gregorio called for the bid results on the stevedore office. Rick distributed the bid tabulation to the committee and said Kevin would brief it. Kevin said we opened bids on the stevedore project on last Tuesday, December 1st, 2 pm in the 3rd floor conference room. We received 7 bids from 7 general contractors. We received all hard copy bids. We received no electronic bids. Our low bid, which is highlighted in yellow, was from M & M Builders in the amount of \$385,898. We had budgeted between \$350 and \$400, so we're kind of in our target range. I did follow up with M & M Builders later that afternoon and again the next morning to make sure that they were okay with their low bid. They spent the evening reviewing and they're comfortable with their bid and so they said they're ready to go. On December 2nd, the day after bids, I made an official request that they provide me with their MBE participation requirement information along with Non-collusion Declaration documentation. They can take 10 days to provide me with that information from the time I request it. So that information is due back before December 12th, but I actually got a call right before I walked out the door to come to this meeting and they were on their way to the office to drop that paperwork off. So I will be turning that paperwork into you, Rick shortly. So at this time, I am recommending acceptance of the bid from M & M Builders, pending the satisfactory review of their documentation that they're providing me with today.

Commissioner Gregorio said I have one question. The low bid is pretty significantly lower. I'm estimating 12-15%, that range. Are you comfortable that they can actually do the work for the price that they've set? Kevin said that's the reason I had two phone conversations with them. I talked to them later that day and asked them that very same question. I asked them (inaudible). I had a follow-up conversation. They said they were comfortable with their bid. I know most of the general contractors on the list and I know why three or four of them are very high. I know their workloads right now. I know their overhead. This is a smaller outfit. So am I comfortable? Yes, for the most part I'm comfortable. I'm always a little uncomfortable when someone tries a low bid. I gave them every opportunity to bow out if they wanted to. They've reviewed their paper work. They said they're okay. Commissioner Gregorio said one last question. Do you know M & M Builders? Have you worked with them before? Kevin said I do not. I've never worked with M & M Builders. I did make a few calls to a few folks and do know a couple of projects they've worked on, a couple of architects they've worked for. They have completed some projects successfully. Some of those projects were public projects. One of the reasons I called them too was to make sure they understood the process in terms of the information that they had to turn in back in to the Port within 10 days. MBE participation documentation can be lengthy if they've done their job. They were very familiar with the process. They were already putting together the paper work. I could probably give you a better answer had I received that documentation this morning versus receiving it this afternoon. They seemed comfortable; they seemed familiar with the process. They've done public work before and so, like I've already said, I'm comfortable, I'm cautiously optimistic. But I'm optimistic that their bid is solid. Commissioner Gregorio said and as I understood it, when you checked with other people they had worked for, they had positive results. Kevin said correct. Commissioner Watkins said Kevin did they indicate what their MBE participation was going to be. Kevin said they did not. Like I said, I'll have that information today. Commissioner Griggs said did y'all look at their bid and see exactly where that cost saving came from. Kevin said no, our opportunity on bid day was only to analyze the bottom line number they provided us with and to review their bid forms, their bid tab and their bid bonds to make sure that they were filled out correctly for State Bid Law. And so that is really the only thing we had an opportunity to review at this time.

Commissioner Pannell said I mean, if there was a—I'm assuming--a overwhelming need for this rush for this bid to be approved, I would not have a problem with that. But if they don't have all the documents, especially the minority participation documents, I would not feel comfortable sitting here going to give somebody something. I mean let's reverse this and you had all that minority participation documents, but

they didn't have their dollar amount on here, and they want to give you a dollar amount later on. We would not be awarding the bid on something that's not complete, and I'm saying that if I already know, and I'm in this business and I know, if someone tells a contractor he already has the job, he may not put a lot of effort in on the minority participation program. Commissioner Watkins said isn't this going to fall right back to the Board meeting? Eric said this is for informational purposes. This is for presentation. There's not a Board action. Commissioner Pannell said I thought he was asking for a vote on this. Eric said his job today is to present the bid tabulation and to make a recommendation. It's the Commission's job to let this lay over period to then receive that information and allow you more time to make the decision. Commissioner Pannell said but my question would be, if we make that recommendation today, would you then go back and inform them that we have? Kevin said yes sir. Eric said you could do that. Commissioner Pannell said it would still have the same effect. Kevin said my point to making a recommendation for acceptance was based upon the review of the documentation that they're going to provide us later today. If that documentation is not acceptable, if they've not met their goals... Commissioner Pannell said my problem, Kevin, is at this point you are saying that you're going to make the decision as to whether that's acceptable. I'm looking for dollar amount and we're making a decision about whether it's accepted or not. I'm not going to vote on something and give somebody else the approval to decide whether it's acceptable or not to me. I'm not prepared to do that. I'm not prepared to do that at this point. Commissioner Bryant said would you send us the information that you get from them today? Kevin said yes. As soon as I receive it, I'll be getting it to the Port. Commissioner Bryant said okay. Kevin said my point in making the recommendation was just to say that their paperwork is in order, the bid was in order; it was within budget and that there were no mistakes on the bid form. And so pending the review of that additional documentation, if it's acceptable, then we'll move forward. If not, then. Commissioner Bryant said there's no action requested today. Kevin said I'm not asking for any action. Eric said there's no action requested today. Eric said one thing that will help explain this situation is several years ago the process was for MBE information to be turned in with the bid. The State legislature changed the bid laws such that on bid day a very limited amount of information was only required, mainly the bid and just a few other documents. What was absent on bid day was all this backup documentation. However, we are allowed to demand it within "X" number of days, which we've done. So we're in this period of review if you will. There's no pressure to make a decision on this project, and it is not something where we're in a bind and need the office immediately. So there's time for review.

Commissioner Pannell said I need to ask Danye a question. And you may not know the answer, but I would like to have the answer. Is there a process that—not if, I know there is a process—that a person can sign that he will meet minimum requirement and then there's no need for us to have that paperwork. He just has to meet that requirement. If he does not meet that requirement, then he is determined to be non-responsive which may have an effect on his next bid and may not because, but still in the process that we're in now, we're putting our program together because we never see—we see numbers on what that final project cost does, but we never see numbers on whether they fulfilled that minority participation or not. We have a new program and I think at some point---it's just like they changed the speed limit to 75 on the highway. At some point, they put up signs to let you know that. So I'm saying, we have a new program. Is there at some point, if we keep doing it the way we've been doing it, will this program kick in to mean something? Danye said as Eric indicated earlier, under the Louisiana Public Bid Laws, various 10 day time periods from the opening of bids in order to submit additional information required by public entities. So for the purposes of this meeting, today it is not, if you will, the acceptance of the lowest responsible bidder, per se, but for informational purposes only. That determination will be made after the necessary documentation has been submitted to the Port. Commissioner Pannell said I'm not going to be the bid voice, but I'm saying I know good and well the City of Shreveport and Parish of Caddo have different laws that cannot supersede the State law. And I'm saying that if you are telling people that

they've got a job before they even give us numbers, we need to back up and look at this and see if there's some kind of way. But if they signed something that said we're going to meet the numbers, then go ahead and do this process we started. But the State has a lot of crazy processes that don't work. If they worked, the numbers wouldn't be what they were now. Dannye said there was an amendment to the Public Bid Law many years ago that instituted that particular requirement. Commissioner Pannell said (inaudible) does it; but New Orleans does it. They don't have to tell you—nobody that they're using—they don't have to give you anything. All they have to do is just sign an affidavit saying that we will do 25 or we will do 30% of this project. They aren't stuck on 10 days of doing nothing. You can wait until you start on the project and find your 25%. Dannye said, now of course, as you well know, Commissioner Pannell, New Orleans is excepted from the general State law under many circumstances. But I would tell you that with regard to the City of Shreveport and Parish of Caddo and other public entities, that particular amendment to the Bid Law is a requirement without question. Commissioner Watkins said they basically knew they were low bidder the day we opened the bids, so they knew as long as they were going to be responsive, they were going to get the job anyway—if you're sitting on their side of the table. Dannye said right. And then that's provided that they meet various criteria within that 10 day time period. In other words, they are the apparent low bidder right now. Commissioner Gregorio said let me tell you what I am hearing at the moment is that there is no action needed by the Board today, none whatsoever. Eric said that's correct. Commissioner Gregorio said we have a recommendation from our architect that this is the apparent low bidder and from the discussion of the Board, we want to make sure we see the minority participation before we tell anybody they have anything. Dannye said that's correct. Commissioner Gregorio said if that's the case, I think it satisfies all of our statements we've been making. If that, James, if that's comfortable, I think we can move forward. Are you good? Commissioner Pannell said I'm comfortable when I hear somebody say the participation... Commissioner Bryant said so you will email us that information and if we're not comfortable with that information we receive, then on the Board meeting day, we wouldn't be recommending this. Dannye said that's correct. Eric said our current process would have it that this company, M & M Builders, would provide to us however many minority companies they intend to hire and then before every pay estimate is processed by us, we would receive an interim pay report that would show which minority contractors have been hired, every minority contractor, and it would allow us a checks and a balance, if you will, an internal control to monitor if they are meeting their obligation to us. Dannye said and one other comment---and it's not only limited to minority participation. There may be other documents that the Port would require, any other government entity may require such as a performance bond or a payment bond, or other documentation that's required within that ten day time period. Commissioner Pannell said and once again, my point is this—is that how many times do we get a bid in here and we have a percentage of 25%. Go back and look at every one of the bids that come in here and show me one that met the 25. You are gonna have a couple of them. What happens is that someone says I can only meet numbers of 15%. So we sit here and we say okay. We have to have something in place to say no, because we need to go back. Commissioner Bryant said let me ask you something. ...Commissioner Pannell said there's no incentive for a person to meet a 25% goal when nobody has been stopped for not meeting a 25% goal. We let them know they got the job even before we even know their numbers. I mean---I'm through. Commissioner Bryant said did any of these other bidders on here, did they provide the documentation? How many of them provided the documentation prior to...Kevin said they are not required to provide it. Commissioner Bryant said I know they are not required, but did any one of them--, so regardless we wouldn't know the MBE participation at the time of the bid opening for any of the bidders. Kevin said correct. Commissioner Bryant said okay. Kevin said the way it is set up is we open the bids, if the bid looks clean, it's in budget, they were signed correctly, the bid bond is included, the apparent low bidder then gets notified that they have ten days to follow with this documentation. We don't ask all bidders. We only ask the low bidder. Commissioner Bryant said and so that's because based on the new bid requirements, you have to give them ten days after the opening.

Kevin said the participation requirements and the non-collusion requirements is the two items they have to follow. Commissioner Pannell said I'm assuming our language said the lowest responsive bidder. Kevin said I guess technically they are not determined that they are our lowest responsive bidder. Commissioner Pannell said to me if he's lowest with the dollar amount, and there's someone else that meets everything including the minority participation amount, then to me he's more responsive than the man that's not given me anything. And until people understand that, they're going to keep giving us this stuff here saying I can't find anybody. We can't—this is the best I can do with the 10 or 5. I'm saying, there's been a situation...I've sit here and voted for 5% and I had no problem with voting for that, because I know in that industry you're not going to find any more than 5%. But when do we say no? Danye said and I think what's relevant here is that M & M is the apparent low bidder. The Board has not determined whether M & M is the lowest responsible bidder, who bid in accordance with the plans and specifications as advertised. I think that determination will be made following the submittal of the minority participation documents.

Commissioner Gregorio said we've had a good discussion. Any other discussion or are we through? Hearing no other business, the meeting is adjourned 1:02 p.m.

.Commissioner Gregorio said the minutes for the Operations Committee of December 7, 2015 are in your package. If there's no amendments or changes, I move that they be accepted. Commissioner Murphy said it was moved that the Operations Committee Report of December 7, 2015 be accepted. Calling for discussion and hearing none, the vote was taken. All in favor, "Aye". Opposed, "Nay". The motion passed unanimously.

Intergovernmental Committee Report of December 14, 2015: The Intergovernmental Committee meeting was called to order by Committee Chairman Sam N. Gregorio at approximately 12 Noon on December 14, 2015 in the Board Room at the Regional Commerce Center. Committee members present: Sam N. Gregorio and Steve Watkins. A quorum was present. Commissioner Roy Griggs was also in attendance. Staff members in attendance were Eric England, Danye Malone and Hettie Agee. Guest: Markey Pierre, Southern Strategy Group.

Commissioner Gregorio called for any public comments. Hearing none, he called on Markey and she presented the Southern Strategy Legislative Update. At the conclusion, she called for questions.

Commissioner Gregorio said a couple of things. The luncheons are a great idea. I know several of the newly-elected people closely so I would like to be there whenever it is scheduled. So please keep me in that loop. Markey said we will work around your schedule. Commissioner Gregorio said I also suggest Jay Luneau in Alexandria. Markey said I've already met with Jay and talked with him and we'll bring him up here. Commissioner Gregorio said the other thing I was going to ask is a lot of their talk was about cutting back exemptions etc. Do you see that as affecting us in this coming year? Markey said yes, I do believe that that is something we have to pay very close attention to. As you know the number of exemptions that they looked at to address could give us possible concern because we use these exemptions when we are seeking out new tenants and cultivating relationships with folks that are interested in doing business here in Caddo Parish and Bossier Parish here at the Port of Caddo-Bossier. And so we tried to continue to work with the Administration. They only suspended these exemptions for a period of time. The challenge has been that there are more than \$8 billion dollars worth of exemptions that we are giving away. When you look at the 200 top corporate folks in the State of Louisiana and the

number of exemptions that they're getting, a significant number of them don't contribute toward paying any type of taxes. I think that they're going to look to try to find a balance with the business community, and what the State needs to do because the State quite frankly, this Administration believes that the State can't continue to be that generous in their exemptions budget because it is a huge budget. And when we compare to what they pay the percentage is...you've got a significant number of those corporations that pay "0" in sales and corporate taxes. And so I think that they are going to look at that. We'll have to be very vigilant in understanding what their attempt is and how that really impacts the folks that currently doing business here in the Port that actually receives some of the exemptions and probably try to keep them apprised of what's going on as well. We're not unique in the situation. We have this concern with all of our businesses that are doing business across the State especially at the other ports as well. So we work together in a team effort to make sure we keep everybody apprised of what's going on. Commissioner Gregorio said are there any legislative efforts that we should make or want to make for the upcoming session? Markey said I think it's going to be important to see what comes out of the transition teams. So as you know the Administration appointed their transition chairs in the various issues that were reported to the State, from K-12 to Transportation to Health Care. They're going to be reporting that. Hopefully we get an opportunity to weigh in on those recommendations that are coming back and look to see what he would like to do in his coming legislative agenda and then I think we're able to try to formulate some positions to see if we need to some additional legislation that looks toward helping the Port of Caddo-Bossier. Right now what I have found is to cultivate relationships inside the departments in which we do business are most effective than actually filing a piece of legislation and making sure that our folks are on board because a lot of things that we can do by rule on existing statutes that are in there. So it's a better process. I think it's a better process for us by maintaining those strong relationships within the Department of Economic Development, Department of Transportation, within the folks at the Port Priority and the Ports Association because we get a lot of things done without actually having to file a bill ourselves.

Commissioner Gregorio called for any other questions and thanked Markey for her presentation. We appreciate your help.

Commissioner Gregorio asked Eric if he would like to speak about the Governor's Transition Outlook or was that covered by Markey. Eric said the latter so I have nothing further to add. Commissioner Gregorio adjourned the meeting at approximately 12:32 p.m.

Commissioner Gregorio said the Intergovernmental Committee meeting was held on December 14, 2015. The minutes are in your package. Unless there's any amendments, I move they be accepted. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Bryant. Calling for discussion and hearing none, the vote was taken. All in favor, "Aye". Opposed, "Nay". The motion passed unanimously.

NEW BUSINESS:

Nominating Committee: Commissioner President Capt. Thomas F. Murphy said in accordance with the By-Laws of the Caddo-Bossier Port Commission, the Nominating Committee, composed of 3 commissioners, shall be appointed with the approval of the Commission during the regular meeting held in December each year. At this time, I would like to appoint Commissioners Austin, Bryant and Hall as the 2016 Nominating Committee with

Commissioner Erica Bryant serving as Chairwoman. They will report back to this Board to present their slate of officers at the January 21st Board Meeting. As President, I move this committee be formed as presented and request a second. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Gregorio. Commissioner Murphy said it had been moved and seconded that this Nominating Committee be accepted. Any discussion? All in favor, please say "Aye". Opposed, "Nay". It passed unanimously.

AYES: Commissioners: Thomas F. Murphy, Sam N. Gregorio, Rick C. Prescott, Erica R. Bryant, James D. Hall, James L. Pannell and Steve Watkins.

NAYS: None

ABSENT: Lynn Austin and Roy Griggs

ABSTAINING: None

Ordinance No. 4 – An Ordinance Amending the Budget of Estimated Revenues and Expenditures for the General Fund for the Year 2015, and Otherwise Providing with Respect Thereto: Mr. England said as you know we amend and adopt our budgets by Ordinance and today on the agenda we have those four Ordinances. We begin with Ordinance No. 4 which is relative to the General Fund for 2015. We are proposing the amendments to the budgets through this Ordinance. The motion was made by Commissioner Watkins and seconded by Commissioner Prescott. Commissioner Murphy said it has been moved and seconded to adopt Ordinance No. 4. Any discussion? All in favor, please say "Aye". Opposed, "Nay". It passed unanimously.

AYES: Commissioners: Thomas F. Murphy, Sam N. Gregorio, Rick C. Prescott, Erica R. Bryant, James D. Hall, James L. Pannell and Steve Watkins.

NAYS: None

ABSENT: Lynn Austin and Roy Griggs

ABSTAINING: None

Ordinance No. 5 – An Ordinance Amending the Budget of Estimated Revenues and Expenditures for the Capital Operations Fund for the Year 2015, and Otherwise Providing with Respect Thereto: Mr. England said this is the second of two budgets, Ordinance for the 2015 amendments. It's recommended for adoption at this time. A motion to adopt was made by Commissioner Bryant and seconded by Commissioner Gregorio. Commissioner Murphy said it had been moved and seconded to adopt Ordinance No. 5. Any discussion? All in favor, please say "Aye". Opposed, "Nay". It passed unanimously.

AYES: Commissioners: Thomas F. Murphy, Sam N. Gregorio, Rick C. Prescott, Erica R. Bryant, James D. Hall, James L. Pannell and Steve Watkins.

NAYS: None

ABSENT: Lynn Austin and Roy Griggs

ABSTAINING: None

Ordinance No. 6 – An Ordinance Adopting the Budget of Estimated Revenues and Expenditures for the General Fund for the Year 2016, and Otherwise Providing with Respect Thereto: Mr. England said this Ordinance is recommended for adoption and has been prepared in accordance with the discussions at the recent Executive Committee Meeting. A motion to adopt was made by Commissioner Watkins and seconded by Commissioner

Gregorio. Commissioner Murphy said it had been moved and seconded to adopt Ordinance No. 6. Any discussion? All in favor, please say "Aye". Opposed, "Nay". It passed unanimously.

AYES: Commissioners: Thomas F. Murphy, Sam N. Gregorio, Rick C. Prescott, Erica R. Bryant, James D. Hall, James L. Pannell and Steve Watkins.

NAYS: None

ABSENT: Lynn Austin and Roy Griggs

ABSTAINING: None

Ordinance No. 7 – An Ordinance Adopting the Budget of Estimated Revenues and Expenditures for the Capital Operations Fund for the Year 2016, and Otherwise Providing with Respect Thereto:

Mr. England said also Ordinance No. 7 has been prepared and the budget that corresponds with it in relation to the discussions at the November Executive Committee meeting and is recommended for adoption. A motion to adopt was made by Commissioner Gregorio and seconded by Commissioner Bryant. Commissioner Murphy said it had been moved and seconded we adopt Ordinance No. 7. Any discussion? All in favor, please say "Aye". Opposed, "Nay". It passed unanimously.

AYES: Commissioners: Thomas F. Murphy, Sam N. Gregorio, Rick C. Prescott, Erica R. Bryant, James D. Hall, James L. Pannell and Steve Watkins.

NAYS: None

ABSENT: Lynn Austin and Roy Griggs

ABSTAINING: None

2016 Calendar of Events/Caddo-Bossier Parishes Port Commission Meetings:

Mr. England said this line item is just that, the 2016 Meeting Calendars. We would invite all the members of the public that are here to obtain a copy as it has all the meetings for 2016. We will also publish this in our official journal and post it on our website. It is recommended for adoption. A motion to adopt was made by Commissioner Prescott and seconded by Commissioner Bryant. Commissioner Murphy said it had been moved and seconded we adopt the 2016 Calendar of Events and Caddo-Bossier Parishes Port Commission meetings. Any discussion? All in favor, please say "Aye". Opposed, "Nay". The 2016 Calendar of Events and Meetings is adopted.

AYES: Commissioners: Thomas F. Murphy, Sam N. Gregorio, Rick C. Prescott, Erica R. Bryant, James D. Hall, James L. Pannell and Steve Watkins.

NAYS: None

ABSENT: Lynn Austin and Roy Griggs

ABSTAINING: None

Official Journal of the Caddo-Bossier Parishes Port Commission:

Mr. England said it's our recommendation that the *Shreveport TIMES* be the official journal of the Caddo-Bossier Parishes Port Commission. We need an action today from the Commission for that please. A motion to adopt was made by Commissioner Gregorio and seconded by Commissioner Watkins. Commissioner Murphy said it had been moved and seconded to adopt the *TIMES* as the official journal of the Caddo-Bossier Parishes Port Commission. Any discussion? All in favor, please say "Aye". Opposed, "Nay". The 2016 Calendar of Events and Meetings is adopted.

AYES: Commissioners: Thomas F. Murphy, Sam N. Gregorio, Rick C. Prescott, Erica R. Bryant, James D. Hall, James L. Pannell and Steve Watkins.

NAYS: None

ABSENT: Lynn Austin and Roy Griggs

ABSTAINING: None

Port Stevedore Office Discussion: Mr. England said as you know at our most recent Operations Committee meeting we received an initial presentation from the design architect, Kevin Bryan with KBA. At that time we were without the good faith effort compliance forms that are part of our bid package. Our instructions at that time were to obtain those forms from the apparent low bidder, which we have done. These forms are in your packages and Rick's going to give an overview of them and they can be found immediately following the 2016 calendar.

Rick said just to recap, there were seven bidders on this project. The low bidder was M&M Builders at \$385,898. There was a range of up to \$488,000, and so we went back to the low bidder and asked him to verify his numbers because legally if there's such a range, we were trying to make sure he didn't leave something out. We gave him the opportunity to withdraw. He felt like his numbers were good; he has a certain number of days to do that. He stuck with his numbers and then we asked for the minority contractor participation.

In the package you have you should see Form 1 and you have a list of the contractors he addressed. In the back of it you'll see kind of a matrix that Kevin did to address what they are as far as what type of minority contractor. H&W is not in the list of that package because they are a demolition contractor and they are a woman-owned business. KLI is not in there. They are a multi-state electrical contractor. They have MBE/DBE throughout their states. The summation of that was from that he picked a Schedule of M/WBE Participation which is pg. 3 which is the final list that he wants to use and has agreed to. You'll see the percentages there associated with it. A summation of that is black contractor is 12.97%; Hispanic was 11.67% and woman-owned was 10.34 for a total of 34.98% minority participation. You'll see Hunt listed twice. They are In fact the same company, masonry. Eric said that's the first and last contractor on the 3rd page. Rick said also you'll see the backup documentation from Fair Share listing on the Shreveport system, plus the conversations that Kevin had to verify and I had a couple. I think that's the information I have for you and the license. I think that the obligation has been met here. That's the results of our investigation. Commissioner Murphy called for any discussion on this item. A motion to accept the bid of M&M Builders was made by Commissioner Hall and seconded by Commissioner Watkins to accept the bid of the low bidder. Commissioner Murphy called for any discussion. Hearing none, he said all in favor, please say "Aye". Opposed, "Nay". Hearing no "Nay's", it passed unanimously.

AYES: Commissioners: Thomas F. Murphy, Sam N. Gregorio, Rick C. Prescott, Erica R. Bryant, James D. Hall, and Steve Watkins.

NAYS: None

ABSENT: Lynn Austin, James L Pannell (left meeting before item was presented) and Roy Griggs

ABSTAINING: None

Port Director's Report: Mr. England said Commissioners, on behalf of the staff we want to thank you for another incredible year. We had a difficult year with the flood. We appreciate all the hours that were put in in the wake of it. We know that 2016 is going to be better and we know that bright things are in our future. We want to wish all of you a Merry Christmas and a Happy New Year and we look forward to seeing you and getting back to work shortly after the beginning of the year.

Commissioner Murphy said in the back of your package. I put in the "Little Known Cellphone Tips". With that, I will echo what Eric said and wish you all a very Merry Christmas and thank our guests for coming. He adjourned the meeting at approximately 5:00 p.m..

Commissioner Bryant said she just wanted to recognize our new Commissioner of Caddo Commission, District 8, Mike Middleton. Just wanted to welcome him aboard and we look forward to working with you as a group. Mr. Middleton said thank you for the acknowledgement. Commissioner Murphy thanked him.

Respectfully submitted,

Commissioner Rick C. Prescott
Secretary-Treasurer

January 2016 Meeting Notices!!

Next Regularly Scheduled Meeting: Thursday, January 21, 2016, 4:30 p.m.

Board Room, 6000 Doug Attaway Blvd., Shreveport, LA 71115

Marketing and Operations Committee Meetings, Monday, January 11, 2016, 12 Noon

6000 Doug Attaway Blvd., Shreveport, LA 71115